# U.S.-China Economic and Security Review Commission

Issue Brief



**February 9, 2017** 

## As Chinese Pressure on Taiwan Grows, Beijing Turns Away from Cross-Strait "Diplomatic Truce"

Matthew Southerland, Policy Analyst, Security and Foreign Affairs

### A Return to "Poaching" Taiwan's Diplomatic Partners?

On December 21, 2016, Sao Tome and Principe—a country consisting of a group of islands and islets off the western coast of central Africa—broke diplomatic relations with Taiwan, and on December 26 re-established diplomatic relations with China.\*1 This is the second time since the election of Taiwan President Tsai Ing-wen† that China has re-established diplomatic relations with one of Taipei's former diplomatic partners, marking a change in Beijing's behavior. The first time was shortly before President Tsai's inauguration in March 2016, when China re-established relations with The Gambia, which had severed ties with Taiwan more than two years before.‡ In 2008, Taipei and Beijing reached a tacit understanding to stop using financial incentives to compete for recognition from each other's diplomatic partners—a "diplomatic truce." During the period that followed, Beijing also rejected overtures from several of Taiwan's diplomatic partners to establish diplomatic relations with China. Beijing's recent shift is one of the latest in a series of efforts to pressure the Tsai Administration. Despite President Tsai's pragmatic approach to cross-Strait relations and attempts to compromise, Beijing views her with suspicion due to her unwillingness to endorse the "One China" framework§ for cross-Strait relations.

Sao Tome's decision to cut ties with Taipei appears to have been related—at least in part—to a request from Sao Tome for more aid.<sup>5</sup> A statement released by Taiwan's Ministry of Foreign Affairs included the following: "The government of Sao Tome and Principe ... with excessive financial difficulties, and demands beyond those [Taiwan] could meet, has ignored 20 years of friendly diplomatic relations, playing both sides of the Taiwan Strait while holding out for the highest bidder." Sao Tome and Principe's prime minister Patrice Trovoada implied to journalists that financial imperatives played a role in severing ties with Taiwan, saying that the decision "was the most correct decision for Sao Tome and Principe.... We have our program and we have a commitment to the people to improve their living conditions." He referred to China as a "very important strategic relationship ... the second biggest economy in the world and permanent member of the (UN) Security Council."

<sup>\*</sup> After gaining independence from Portugal in 1975, Sao Tome and Principe established diplomatic relations with China. Then, in 1997, Sao Tome and Principe established diplomatic relations with Taiwan, and China suspended ties. Associated Press, "China Resumes Ties with Sao Tome, Which Turned away from Taiwan," December 26, 2016. https://www.nytimes.com/2016/12/26/world/asia/china-taiwan-sao-tome-diplomatic-relations.html.

<sup>†</sup> President Tsai is also the chairperson of the historically pro-independence Democratic Progressive Party (DPP).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>‡</sup> There is no public evidence that suggests Beijing enticed or pressured The Gambia to cut diplomatic relations with Taipei. According to officials from Taiwan's Ministry of Foreign Affairs, The Gambia's decision was related to Taipei's rejection of a request by Yahya Jammeh, The Gambia's president at the time, for additional aid in the form of a lump sum of \$10 million. Angela Tsai and Scully Hsiao, "Gambian Aid Request Linked to Broken Ties with Taiwan: Minister," Focus Taiwan, November 25, 2013. http://focustaiwan.tw/news/aall/201311250017.aspx.

<sup>§</sup> Beijing claims sovereignty over Taiwan and exerts great effort to promote unification between Taiwan and China. Beijing insists that cross-Strait communication and talks be based on the "1992 Consensus," a tacit understanding reached at a meeting between representatives of Taiwan and China in 1992 that there is only "one China" but that each side may maintain its own interpretation of the meaning of "one China."

Limited information available in media reporting and Chinese government statements make it challenging to confirm whether Beijing enticed or pressured Sao Tome to cut diplomatic relations with Taiwan, or merely indulged Sao Tome's wish to re-establish diplomatic ties. Regardless, given Beijing's previous rejection of overtures from several countries to establish diplomatic relations—including from Sao Tome in 20149—its newfound willingness to establish relations reflects a trend of incrementally increasing pressure on Taipei. Richard C. Bush of the Brookings Institution and Bonnie S. Glaser of the Center for Strategic and International Studies separately assess that Beijing arranged for Sao Tome to cut ties with Taipei and re-establish diplomatic relations with Beijing, likely in retaliation for President Tsai's phone call to then President-elect Donald J. Trump in December 2016.

According to media reporting, Beijing may have made overtures to Burkina Faso. The revelation in a January Bloomberg report that "people and companies with links to China" offered funding to the government of Burkina Faso in exchange for ending diplomatic relations with Taiwan\* <sup>12</sup> suggests China has indeed resumed actively courting at least one of Taiwan's partners with financial incentives. China has an advantage in this kind of competition. For example, according to estimates, China's outbound foreign direct investment stocks at the end of 2016 were nearly four times as much as Taiwan's. <sup>13</sup> In an interview with Bloomberg, Burkina Faso's foreign minister Alpha Barry said, "We get outrageous proposals telling us, 'if you sign with Beijing we'll offer you \$50 billion or even more." <sup>14</sup> However, Minister Barry added, "Taiwan is our friend and our partner. We're happy and we see no reason to reconsider the relationship." <sup>15</sup>

Taiwan has diplomatic relations with only 21 countries.<sup>†</sup> These relationships, even those with small countries like Sao Tome and Principe, are important to Taiwan's efforts to preserve its voice in international affairs. Symbolically, they confer legitimacy on Taiwan's position on the world stage in the face of marginalization by China. <sup>16</sup> Practically, their advocacy for Taiwan's participation in international organizations helps Taiwan in its quest for greater international space. <sup>17</sup> These are not Taiwan's only sources of international support, however. In fact, Taiwan almost certainly gains more from its *unofficial* relations with countries that have extensive international influence, such as the United States, that promote an expansion of opportunities for Taiwan to participate in the international community and support Taiwan in other ways. <sup>18</sup> Still, diplomatic relations are an important component of Taiwan's toolbox for maintaining a presence on the international stage.

Some observers in Taiwan are concerned that several countries could follow Sao Tome and Principe in severing diplomatic relations with Taiwan.<sup>19</sup> In December, for example, Taiwan's deputy foreign minister Hou Ching-shan voiced concerns that Taiwan's diplomatic relations with another country, which he did not name, might also be at risk.<sup>20</sup> In 2016, there were reports that Beijing and the Vatican—which has diplomatic relations with Taiwan<sup>‡</sup> — were in talks to address longstanding areas of disagreement.<sup>21</sup> A resolution of these issues and warming of relations between China and the Holy See could put Taiwan's relations with the Vatican at risk.

### Other Levers China is Using to Pressure Taiwan

In addition to re-establishing relations with Sao Tome and Principe and The Gambia, Beijing has been using various other levers to pressure Taiwan since President Tsai's election. Among the measures Beijing is taking are the following:

**Beijing suspends cross-Strait communication:** Last year, for the first time in eight years, Beijing suspended official and semiofficial cross-Strait communication and meetings. <sup>22</sup> In June 2016, a spokesperson for China's Taiwan

U.S.-China Economic and Security Review Commission

2

<sup>\*</sup> It is unclear whether these people and companies are connected to the Chinese government. Pauline Bax, Bloomberg News Journalist, interview with Commission staff, January 30, 2017.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>†</sup> Taiwan has diplomatic relations with Belize, Burkina Faso, the Dominican Republic, El Salvador, Guatemala, Haiti, the Holy See, Honduras, Kiribati, the Marshall Islands, Nauru, Nicaragua, Palau, Panama, Paraguay, Saint Kitts and Nevis, Saint Lucia, Saint Vincent and the Grenadines, Solomon Islands, Swaziland, and Tuvalu. Taiwan's Ministry of Foreign Affairs, *Diplomatic Allies.* http://www.mofa.gov.tw/en/AlliesIndex.aspx?n=DF6F8F246049F8D6&sms=A76B7230ADF29736.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>‡</sup> The Vatican established ties with the Republic of China government in 1942 and maintained those ties after the government moved to Taiwan and Beijing expelled the Vatican's representative from China in 1951. Kevin Hsu, "China and the Vatican: Toward a New Era?" Diplomat, September 22, 2016. http://thediplomat.com/2016/09/china-and-the-vatican-towards-a-new-era/.

<sup>§</sup> Beijing suspended communication and meetings between the semiofficial Straits Exchange Foundation and the Association for Relations Across the Taiwan Straits. Taiwan's Straits Exchange Foundation and China's Association for Relations Across the Taiwan Strait facilitate

Affairs Office\* announced that "the cross-Strait contact and communication mechanisms have been suspended because the Taiwan side has not recognized the '1992 Consensus,' this common political foundation that embodies the one China principle." However, official cross-Strait communication appears to be ongoing at the working level. <sup>24</sup>

*Beijing limits cross-Strait tourism:* During the Commission's June 2016 trip to Taiwan, a Taiwan official told the Commission that China had reduced visits to Taiwan by Chinese tourists. <sup>25</sup> Between May 20, 2016 (the date of President Tsai's inauguration) and December 27, 2016, the total number of Chinese tourists visiting Taiwan decreased by 36.2 percent and Chinese tourists traveling with tour groups decreased by 51.2 percent, compared to the same period in 2015. <sup>26</sup>

Beijing requests deportation of Taiwan citizens from third countries to China: Between April 2016 and January 2017, 223 Taiwan citizens living in Armenia, Cambodia, Kenya, Malaysia, and Vietnam who were accused of committing telecommunications fraud against people in China were deported to China, rather than to Taiwan.<sup>27</sup> This constituted a break from a pattern of cross-Strait law enforcement cooperation—begun in 2011—in countries with which Taiwan does not have diplomatic relations.<sup>28</sup> Beijing's motivation for not allowing the suspects to be sent to Taiwan initially may have stemmed solely from its desire to crack down on telecommunications fraud against Chinese citizens (the first group of Taiwan citizens deported from Kenya in April 2016 had been arrested in December 2014, and Beijing requested that they be sent to China in January 2015, one year before President Tsai's election).<sup>29</sup> Subsequently, however, Beijing likely also began to view these cases as another means to pressure Taipei.<sup>† 30</sup>

*Taiwan excluded from international organizations:* The UN's International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO) did not invite Taiwan to participate in the 2016 ICAO Council Assembly, in a reversal from the previous assembly, which took place in 2013. A spokesperson for China's Taiwan Affairs Office said Taiwan could not participate because the Tsai Administration had not endorsed the 1992 Consensus. Following President Tsai's election, in addition to ICAO, Taiwan citizens were excluded from participating in several other meetings of UN organizations. Taiwan was also blocked from taking part in an Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) meeting due to pressure from China. Taiwan had been allowed to participate in these meetings in previous years. Furthermore, Taiwan applied to attend Interpol's 2016 general assembly meeting as

cross-Strait negotiations in the absence of formal ties between the governments of Taiwan and China. Although the two bodies are semiofficial organizations, they receive direction from their respective governments.

<sup>\*</sup> The Taiwan Affairs Office is an agency within China's State Council that is responsible for overseeing China's cross-Strait policies. The Mainland Affairs Council, a cabinet-level agency in Taiwan's executive branch, is responsible for overseeing Taiwan's cross-Strait policies.

<sup>†</sup> In August 2016, a journalist requested a Taiwan Affairs Office spokesperson confirm whether Taiwan's Mainland Affairs Council had protested to Beijing through cross-Strait communication channels regarding Kenya's deportation of Taiwan citizens to China. In his response, the spokesperson stated that the mechanisms for cross-Strait communication and talks had been suspended because Taipei had not endorsed the 1992 Consensus. He added that "the Taiwan side should face up to this fact and make practical efforts to resume the working of these mechanisms." China's Taiwan Affairs Office, Taiwan Affairs Office: The People on Both Sides of the Strait Support Cracking down on Telecommunications Fraud According to Law. The Taiwan Side Should Make Practical Efforts to Resume the Working of the Cross-Strait Contacts and Communication Mechanisms, August 8, 2016. http://www.gwytb.gov.cn/wyly/201608/t20160808\_11531895.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>‡</sup> In April 2016, the Belgian government barred a Taiwan government delegation from attending a meeting on the steel sector organized by the Belgian government and the OECD in Brussels. Although Taiwan is not a member of the OECD, it has been allowed to attend OECD steel committee meetings since 2005. In June, a professor of labor relations from Taiwan's Chung Cheng University and a study group she was leading were blocked twice from attending an annual conference of the UN's International Labor Organization. The professor had led study groups to attend the conference in 2014 and 2015 without a problem. In July, Taiwan officials were not allowed to participate in a meeting of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the UN's Committee on Fisheries, an organization in which they have been permitted to participate since 2003. Leaf Chiang, Tai Ya-chen, and Lilian Wu, "Chinese Bullying Sends Taiwan Packing from OECD Meeting," Focus Taiwan, April 19, 2016. http://focustaiwan.tw/news/aipl/201604190009.aspx; Jamey Keaten, "Taiwan Study Group Baffled over Blocked Geneva Visit to UN," Associated Press, June 8, 2016. http://www.usnews.com/news/world/articles/2016-06-08/taiwan-studygroup-baffled-over-blocked-geneva-visit-to-un; and Christie Chen and Yang Shu-min, "Taiwan Officials Forced out of UN Fisheries by Allegedly China." Focus Taiwan, September 2016. http://focustaiwan.tw/search/201609210017.aspx?q=Food%20and%20Agriculture%20Organization.

an observer, but it did not receive an invitation.<sup>35</sup> A Taiwan Affairs Office spokesperson indicated that not endorsing the 1992 Consensus was the root cause.<sup>36</sup>

Taiwan asked to relocate representative office in Nigeria: On January 11, 2017, during a visit by China's foreign minister Wang Yi to Nigeria, which does not have diplomatic relations with Taiwan, Nigeria's foreign minister Geoffrey Onyeama announced that the Nigerian government had told Taipei to move its representative office from the capital to another city. In his comments to journalists, Minister Onyeama said the office "will be moving to Lagos to the extent that they function as a trade mission with a skeletal staff." A spokesperson for China's Ministry of Foreign Affairs said Nigeria's actions "help settle the legacy issue that bears on the political mutual trust between China and Nigeria once and for all, and remove the stumbling blocks obstructing the sound development of bilateral relations." 38

#### The Continued Threat from Chinese Military Modernization

Taiwan also faces an ongoing threat from China's military modernization program that since the 1990s has been primarily focused on preparing for a potential Taiwan conflict. Features of this program include approximately 1,200 short-range ballistic missiles deployed across from Taiwan that could be used to attack Taiwan's ports and airfields; approximately 600 modern combat aircraft; and more than 300 surface combatants, submarines, and missile-armed patrol ships, which increasingly possess a multi-mission capability and advanced weaponry.<sup>39</sup>

The Chinese military's growing capabilities were on display during its recent training-related activities near Taiwan. On November 25, 2016, during long-range training, Chinese military aircraft flew over the Bashi Channel to the south of Taiwan and then over the Miyako Strait to the north of Taiwan to return to China. Taiwan's deputy national defense minister Lee Hsi-ming explained this was the first time Chinese military aircraft had "circled around Taiwan." On December 10, 2016, Chinese military aircraft again conducted long-range training that took them around Taiwan, this time initially flying over the Miyako Strait and returning to China by flying over the Bashi Channel. Then, on January 11 and 12, 2017, China's only operational aircraft carrier sailed through the Taiwan Strait when returning to its homeport after completing training in the South China Sea. This was neither the first time the carrier had sailed through the Strait nor an indication that Beijing was preparing for or anticipating an imminent military contingency. It did, however, carry significant symbolic meaning, particularly in the context of China's actions on multiple fronts to pressure and intimidate Taiwan.\*

For a more comprehensive discussion of China's efforts to pressure Taiwan in 2016 and policy recommendations, see the Commission's 2016 Annual Report to Congress.

**Disclaimer:** The U.S.-China Economic and Security Review Commission was created by Congress to report on the national security implications of the bilateral trade and economic relationship between the United States and the People's Republic of China. For more information, visit *www.uscc.gov* or join the Commission on Facebook.

This report is the product of professional research performed by the staff of the U.S.-China Economic and Security Review Commission, and was prepared at the request of the Commission to supports its deliberations. Posting of the report to the Commission's website is intended to promote greater public understanding of the issues addressed by the Commission in its ongoing assessment of U.S.-China economic relations and their implications for U.S. security, as mandated by Public Law 106-398 and Public Law 113-291. However, it does not necessarily imply an endorsement by the Commission, any individual Commissioner, or the Commission's other professional staff, of the views or conclusions expressed in this staff research report.

<sup>\*</sup> The aircraft carrier passed through the Taiwan Strait for the first time after its commissioning in November 2013 as it sailed to conduct training in the South China Sea, and did so again on its way back to its homeport in December 2013. Wang Jionghua, "China's Aircraft Carrier Passed through the Taiwan Strait Three Times Before. Ministry of National Defense: Its Combat Capability Is Stronger Each Time," Apple Daily, January 5, 2017. Translation. http://www.appledaily.com.tw/realtimenews/article/new/20170105/1028452/.

#### **Endnotes**

<sup>1</sup> Lu Hsin-hui and Lilian Wu, "Taiwan Regrets Sao Tome and Principe Termination of Diplomatic Ties," Focus Taiwan, December 21, 2016. http://focustaiwan.tw/news/aipl/201612210003.aspx; China's Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Foreign Ministry Spokesperson Hua Chunying's Regular Press Conference on December 26, 2016, December 26, 2016. http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\_eng/xwfw\_665399/s2510\_665401/2511\_665403/t1426902.shtml.

<sup>2</sup> Austin Ramzy, "China Resumes Diplomatic Relations with Gambia, Shutting out Taiwan," *New York Times*, March 18, 2016. https://www.nytimes.com/2016/03/19/world/asia/china-gambia-taiwan-diplomatic-relations.html? r=0.

- <sup>3</sup> Taiwan's Office of the President, President Ma Visits Ministry of Foreign Affairs and Expounds the Concept and Strategy of "Flexible Diplomacy," August 4, 2008. Translation. http://www.president.gov.tw/Default.aspx?tabid=131&itemid=14041&rmid=514; China Post, "President-Elect Ma Calls for 'Diplomatic Truce' with China," May 11, 2008. http://www.chinapost.com.tw/taiwan/china-taiwan-relations/2008/05/11/155861/p2/President-elect-Ma.htm.
- <sup>4</sup> Frank Ching, "Is It Good for China to Strip Taiwan of Its Diplomatic Allies?" *Manila Times*, January 10, 2017. http://www.manilatimes.net/good-china-strip-taiwan-diplomatic-allies/306116/; Lucy Hornby and Luc Cohen, "No Ties? No Problem as China Courts Taiwan's Remaining Allies," Reuters, August 9, 2013. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-china-centralamerica-idUSBRE97514C20130806; and Central News Agency, "Sao Tome Breaks Relations. Ministry of Foreign Affairs Expresses Regret and Condemnation [Video]," December 21, 2016. Translation. http://www.cna.com.tw/news/firstnews/201612215010-1.aspx.
- <sup>5</sup> Lu Hsin-hui and Elizabeth Hsu, "Taiwan Unwilling to Engage in Checkbook Diplomacy: MOFA," *Focus Taiwan*, December 21, 2016. http://focustaiwan.tw/news/aipl/201612210010.aspx.
- <sup>6</sup> Taiwan's Ministry of Foreign Affairs, The ROC Government Has Terminated Diplomatic Relations with Sao Tome and Principe with Immediate Effect to Uphold National Dignity, December 21, 2016.

http://www.mofa.gov.tw/en/News\_Content.aspx?n=0E7B91A8FBEC4A94&sms=220E98D761D34A9A&s=0DAB5E49E5B99AE1.

- <sup>7</sup> Reuters, "Sao Tome Broke with Taiwan Owing to Importance of China as Partner: PM," December 22, 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-china-taiwan-saotome-pm-idUSKBN14B1AU?il=0.
- <sup>8</sup> Reuters, "Sao Tome Broke with Taiwan Owing to Importance of China as Partner: PM," December 22, 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-china-taiwan-saotome-pm-idUSKBN14B1AU?il=0.
- <sup>9</sup> Central News Agency, "Sao Tome Breaks Relations. Ministry of Foreign Affairs Expresses Regret and Condemnation [Video]," December 21, 2016. Translation. http://www.cna.com.tw/news/firstnews/201612215010-1.aspx.
- <sup>10</sup> Frank Ching, "Is It Good for China to Strip Taiwan of its Diplomatic Allies?" Manila Times, January 10, 2017.
  http://www.manilatimes.net/good-china-strip-taiwan-diplomatic-allies/306116/; Lucy Hornby and Luc Cohen, "No Ties? No Problem as China Courts Taiwan's Remaining Allies," Reuters, August 9, 2013. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-china-centralamerica-idUSBRE97514C20130806.
- <sup>11</sup> Richard C. Bush, Director of Center for East Asia Policy Studies, Brookings Institution, interview with Commission staff, January 13, 2017; Bonnie S. Glaser, "Managing Cross-Strait Ties in 2017," Center for Strategic and International Studies, China Power Project, January 26, 2017, 7. https://csis-prod.s3.amazonaws.com/s3fs-public/publication/170126\_Glaser\_ManagingCrossStraitTies2017\_Web.pdf?bA60OGyC\_i.RSRPF59tbniPueNhtOhMd.
- <sup>12</sup> Pauline Bax, Simon Gongo, and Lungile Dlamini, "Chinese Billions Fail to Sway Taiwan's Last Two Allies in Africa," Bloomberg, January 24, 2017. <a href="https://www.bloomberg.com/politics/articles/2017-01-24/chinese-billions-fail-to-sway-taiwan-s-last-two-allies-in-africa">https://www.bloomberg.com/politics/articles/2017-01-24/chinese-billions-fail-to-sway-taiwan-s-last-two-allies-in-africa</a>.
- <sup>13</sup> U.S. Central Intelligence Agency, "China," The World Factbook. https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/ch.html; U.S. Central Intelligence Agency, "Taiwan," The World Factbook. https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/tw.html.
- <sup>14</sup> Pauline Bax, Simon Gongo, and Lungile Dlamini, "Chinese Billions Fail to Sway Taiwan's Last Two Allies in Africa," Bloomberg, January 24, 2017. <a href="https://www.bloomberg.com/politics/articles/2017-01-24/chinese-billions-fail-to-sway-taiwan-s-last-two-allies-in-africa">https://www.bloomberg.com/politics/articles/2017-01-24/chinese-billions-fail-to-sway-taiwan-s-last-two-allies-in-africa</a>.
- <sup>15</sup> Pauline Bax, Simon Gongo, and Lungile Dlamini, "Chinese Billions Fail to Sway Taiwan's Last Two Allies in Africa," Bloomberg, January 24, 2017. <a href="https://www.bloomberg.com/politics/articles/2017-01-24/chinese-billions-fail-to-sway-taiwan-s-last-two-allies-in-africa">https://www.bloomberg.com/politics/articles/2017-01-24/chinese-billions-fail-to-sway-taiwan-s-last-two-allies-in-africa</a>.
- <sup>16</sup> Timothy S. Rich, "Status for Sale: Taiwan and the Competition for Diplomatic Recognition," *Issues and Studies* 45:4 (December 2009): 163; J. Michael Cole, "Yes, China Has Re-Established Ties with The Gambia. Now Calm Down," *News Lens*, March 18, 2016. https://international.thenewslens.com/article/38421.
- <sup>17</sup> General Assembly of the United Nations, "H.E. Mr. Yahya Jammeh, President," September 27, 2013.
  <a href="http://gadebate.un.org/countries/gambia">http://gadebate.un.org/countries/gambia</a>; Jenny W. Hsu and Ko Shu-ling, "Ma, MOFA Regret Latest Rejection of UN Attempt," *Taipei Times*, September 19, 2008. <a href="http://www.taipeitimes.com/News/front/archives/2008/09/19/2003423647/1">http://www.taipeitimes.com/News/front/archives/2008/09/19/2003423647/1</a>.
- <sup>18</sup> J. Michael Cole, "Sao Tome and Principe Drops Taiwan, Embraces China," *University of Nottingham, China Policy Institute*, December 21, 2016. https://cpianalysis.org/2016/12/21/sao-tome-and-principe-drops-taiwan-embraces-china/; J. Michael Cole, "Yes, China Has

- Re-Established Ties with The Gambia. Now Calm Down," *News Lens*, March 18, 2016. https://international.thenewslens.com/article/38421.
- <sup>19</sup> Apple Daily, "Ministry of Foreign Affairs: The Light Is Flashing Yellow for Another Diplomatic Partner," December 22, 2016. Translation. http://www.appledaily.com.tw/appledaily/article/headline/20161222/37493696/.
- <sup>20</sup> Lu Yixuan, "Not Only Sao Tome? Ministry of Foreign Affairs: There's Another Yellow Light," *Liberty Times*, December 22, 2016. Translation. <a href="http://news.ltn.com.tw/news/focus/paper/1064136">http://news.ltn.com.tw/news/focus/paper/1064136</a>.
- <sup>21</sup> Gary Cheung and Tony Cheung, "Beijing, Vatican Reach Initial Accord on Appointment of Bishops, Hong Kong Cardinal Says," *South China Morning Post*, August 5, 2016. http://www.scmp.com/news/hong-kong/politics/article/1999710/beijing-vatican-reach-initial-accord-appointment-bishops; Lisa Jucca, Benjamin Kang Lim, and Greg Torode, "After Decades of Mistrust, Pope Pushes for Diplomatic Breakthrough with China," Reuters, July 14, 2016. http://www.reuters.com/investigates/special-report/china-vatican/.
- <sup>22</sup> Dai Ruifen, "Zhang Zhijun: The Mainland Will Not Unilaterally Change Agreements that the Two Sides of the Strait Have Already Signed," *United Daily News*, August 18, 2016. Translation. <a href="http://udn.com/news/story/9263/1902924-%E5%BC%B5%E5%BF%97%E8%BB%8D%EF%BC%9A%E5%85%A9%E5%B2%B8%E5%B7%B2%E7%B0%BD%E7%BD%B2%E5%8D%94%E8%AD%B0-%E9%994%E8%AD%B0-%E9%99%B8%E4%B8%8D%E6%9C%83%E5%96%AE%E6%96%B9%E9%9D%A2%E6%94%B9%E8%AE%8A; China's Taiwan</a>
- %E9%99%B8%E4%B8%8D%E6%9C%83%E5%96%AE%E6%96%B9%E9%DD%A2%E6%94%B9%E8%AE%8A; China's Taiwan Affairs Office, TAO: The People on Both Sides of the Strait Support Cracking down on Telecommunications Fraud According to Law. The Taiwan Side Should Make Practical Efforts to Resume the Working of the Cross-Strait Contacts and Communication Mechanisms, August 8, 2016. http://www.gwytb.gov.cn/wyly/201608/t20160808\_11531895.htm; and China's Taiwan Affairs Office, TAO: Cracking down on Telecommunications Fraud Is Supported by the People on Both Sides of the Taiwan Strait, June 25, 2016. Translation. http://www.gwytb.gov.cn/wyly/201606/t20160625\_11491242.htm.
- <sup>23</sup> China's Taiwan Affairs Office, TAO: Cracking down on Telecommunications Fraud Is Supported by the People on Both Sides of the Taiwan Strait, June 25, 2016. Translation. http://www.gwytb.gov.cn/en/SpokespersonRemarks/201606/t20160627\_11492214.htm.
- <sup>24</sup> Bonnie S. Glaser, "Managing Cross-Strait Ties in 2017," Center for Strategic and International Studies, China Power Project, January 26, 2017, 4. https://csis-prod.s3.amazonaws.com/s3fs-public/publication/170126\_Glaser\_ManagingCrossStraitTies2017\_Web.pdf?bA60OGyC\_i.RSRPF59tbniPueNhtOhMd; Taiwan official, meeting with Commission, Taipei, Taiwan, June 22, 2016.
- <sup>25</sup> Taiwan official, meeting with Commission, Taipei, Taiwan, June 22, 2016.
- <sup>26</sup> Guo Meijun, "MAC: The Best Preparation for the Worst Case Scenario Next Year," *United Daily News*, December 30, 2016. Translation. http://udn.com/news/story/7331/2199980.
- <sup>27</sup> Chen Chia-lun and Evelyn Kao, "China Still Holding 223 Taiwanese Deportees from Other Countries: MAC," Focus Taiwan, January 8, 2017. http://focustaiwan.tw/news/asoc/201701080010.aspx.
- <sup>28</sup> Yu-Jie Chen and Jerome A. Cohen, "Beijing and Taipei Should End Their Tug of War over Repatriation of Criminal Suspects," South China Morning Post, September 29, 2016. http://www.scmp.com/comment/insight-opinion/article/2023276/beijing-and-taipei-should-end-their-tug-war-over; and Jerome A. Cohen and Yu-Jie Chen, "Cross-Strait Cooperation in Fighting Crime," Council on Foreign Relations, July 6, 2011. http://www.cfr.org/world/cross-strait-cooperation-fighting-crime/p25434.
- <sup>29</sup> Michael Turton, "The Truth About the Deportations of Alleged Taiwanese Scammers from Kenya to China," *Diplomat*, May 11, 2016. http://thediplomat.com/2016/05/the-truth-about-the-deporations-of-alleged-taiwanese-scammers-from-kenya-to-china/; Aggrey Mutambo and Angira Zadock, "China Pushes Kenya to Hand over Suspects Linked to Cyber Fraud," *Daily Nation*, January 15, 2015. http://www.nation.co.ke/news/China-Prisoners-Cyber-Crime-Runda-Foreign-Ministry/-/1056/2591004/-/wtwli0/-/index.html.
- <sup>30</sup> Charlie Campbell, "Law and Order Is at the Heart of China-Taiwan Deportation Dispute," *Time*, April 22, 2016. http://time.com/4304515/china-taiwan-kenya-human-rights-crime-sovereignty-tsai-ing-wen/.
- 31 China's Taiwan Affairs Office, TAO: That the Taiwan Side Is Unable to Participate in the 39th International Civil Aviation Organization Assembly Was Completely Caused by the DPP Authorities, September 23, 2016. http://www.gwytb.gov.cn/wyly/201609/t20160923\_11577656.htm.
- <sup>32</sup> Christie Chen and Yang Shu-min, "Taiwan Officials Forced out of UN Fisheries Meeting Allegedly by China," *Focus Taiwan*, September 21, 2016. <a href="http://focustaiwan.tw/search/201609210017.aspx?q=Food%20and%20Agriculture%20Organization">http://focustaiwan.tw/search/201609210017.aspx?q=Food%20and%20Agriculture%20Organization</a>; Jamey Keaten, "Taiwan Study Group Baffled over Blocked Geneva Visit to UN," Associated Press, June 8, 2016. <a href="http://www.usnews.com/news/world/articles/2016-06-08/taiwan-study-group-baffled-over-blocked-geneva-visit-to-un">http://www.usnews.com/news/world/articles/2016-06-08/taiwan-study-group-baffled-over-blocked-geneva-visit-to-un</a>.
- 33 Stacy Hsu and Alison Hsiao, "Taiwan Rejected from OECD Meeting," Taipei Times, April 20, 2016. http://www.taipeitimes.com/News/front/archives/2016/04/20/2003644360/1; Leaf Chiang, Tai Ya-chen, and Lilian Wu, "Chinese Bullying Sends Taiwan Packing from OECD Meeting," Focus Taiwan, April 19, 2016. http://focustaiwan.tw/news/aipl/201604190009.aspx.
- <sup>34</sup> Christie Chen and Yang Shu-min, "Taiwan Officials Forced out of UN Fisheries Meeting Allegedly by China," Focus Taiwan, September 21, 2016. http://focustaiwan.tw/search/201609210017.aspx?q=Food%20and%20Agriculture%20Organization; Jamey Keaten, "Taiwan Study Group Baffled over Blocked Geneva Visit to UN," Associated Press, June 8, 2016. http://www.usnews.com/news/world/articles/2016-06-08/taiwan-study-group-baffled-over-blocked-geneva-visit-to-un; and Stacy Hsu and Alison Hsiao, "Taiwan Rejected from OECD Meeting," Taipei Times, April 20, 2016. http://www.taipeitimes.com/News/front/archives/2016/04/20/2003644360/1.
- 35 Central News Agency, "Taiwan Barred from Interpol Assembly," November 6, 2016. http://www.taipeitimes.com/News/front/archives/2016/11/06/2003658663.

- <sup>36</sup> Yin Junjie, "Taiwan Did Not Receive Interpol Invitation. TAO Replays an Old Tune," Central News Agency, November 5, 2016. Translation. http://www.cna.com.tw/news/acn/201611050078-1.aspx.
- <sup>37</sup> News Agency of Nigeria, "Nigeria Ends Romance with Taiwan," January 11, 2017. http://www.nan.ng/news/nigeria-ends-romance-with-taiwan/.
- <sup>38</sup> China's Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Foreign Ministry Spokesperson Lu Kang's Regular Press Conference on January 12, 2017, January 12, 2017. http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\_eng/xwfw\_665399/s2510\_665401/2511\_665403/t1430128.shtml.
- <sup>39</sup> U.S. Department of Defense, Annual Report to Congress: Military and Security Developments Involving the People's Republic of China 2016, April 26, 2016, 25, 30; Senate Armed Services Committee, Hearing on Worldwide Threats, written testimony of Vincent R. Stewart, February 26, 2015.
- <sup>40</sup> Hsieh Chia-chen and Lilian Wu, "Chinese Aircraft Circled around Taiwan for First Time: MND," Focus Taiwan, December 5, 2016. http://focustaiwan.tw/news/aipl/201612050016.aspx.
- <sup>41</sup> Jason Pan, "Chinese Aircraft Fly around Taiwan," *Taipei Times*, December 11, 2016. http://www.taipeitimes.com/News/front/archives/2016/12/11/2003660975.
- <sup>42</sup> Lu Hsin-hui, "China's Aircraft Carrier Completes Passage through Taiwan Strait," Focus Taiwan, January 12, 2017. http://focustaiwan.tw/news/aipl/201701120001.aspx.